

Term of Spokesperson

Remarks on Procedure, with reference to talk
by Ian Shipsey for the CBCAG, yesterday 14.2.

Max Klein



92nd Meeting of the ATLAS Collaboration Board, CERN, 15 February 2019

Timeline for Collaboration & CB Discussion

In October 2018 and February 2019 the Collaboration Board Chair Advisory Group discussed the term of the ATLAS Spokesperson.

The conclusion was to bring the topic to the Collaboration and the Collaboration Board, and that it would be helpful for the CBCAG to develop a proposal and present it, and the deliberations that led to it, as a starting point for efficient Collaboration and Collaboration Board discussion.

The CBCAG notes: changing the Spokesperson term would need wide support in the Collaboration, which requires time to understand this issue and its consequences. The timeline we foresee for this:

ATLAS Week February 2019: Discussion in the Collaboration and Collaboration Board introduced by CBCAG.

(ATLAS Week June 2019: Decision taken by the Collaboration Board.



- Calin Alexa - Bukarest
- Ludovica Aperio Bella - CERN
- Shikma Bressler - Weizmann
- Alexander Cheplakov - Dubna
- Brian Cole - Columbia
- Claudia Glasman - Madrid
- Deepak Kar - Witwatersrand
- Marco Leite - Sao Paulo
- Fabienne Ledroit - Grenoble
- Jim Pilcher - Chicago
- Ian Shipsey - Oxford
- Jonas Strandberg - Stockholm
- Geoffrey Taylor - Melbourne
- Tamara Schroeder - Montreal
- Haijun Yang - Shanghai

CBCAG serves as Search Committee for Spokesperson, with CB Chair and Deputy. Diverse composition, in all aspects. The Group, following the election in 2018, decided in October to evaluate the options of term, efficiency and consequences.



Document on the issue of the term of spokesperson endorsed by the CBCAG, in agreement with current Spokesperson and deputies, as input to this week's discussions.

Intention is to send this to the Collaboration, subject to new inputs this week, for efficient consideration and decision in the CB in June 2019.

The term of Karl Jakobs ends in February 2021. Thus the next election will be opened in October 2019 such that this consideration is on the structure and free of any personal considerations.

Three-page draft summary of evaluating the

Term of the ATLAS Spokesperson

The Collaboration Board Chair Advisory Group*)
February 12, 2019

Motivation

The ATLAS Collaboration consists of a significant fraction of the world wide particle physics community. We conduct our science on behalf of the taxpayers of the world. The large international LHC collaborations inspire the public, and our collaboration will exist for at least another twenty years. Given our longevity, our scale, and our importance to the future of our field, we have a responsibility to reflect regularly on our collaboration organizational structures and their efficiency as we strive for an ever more perfect collaboration.

Why discuss this now? Given the Spokesperson cadence of 2+2 years (examples are Fabiola Gianotti, Dave Charlton, and Karl Jakobs) and the importance of discussing terms of office well before an election to that office, the only time the Spokesperson term can be discussed is once every four years. That time is now.

Timeline for Collaboration & CB Discussion

In October the Collaboration Board Chair Advisory Group (CBCAG) discussed the term of the ATLAS Spokesperson. The conclusion of the discussion was to bring the topic to the Collaboration and the Collaboration Board, and that it would be helpful to produce a position paper laying out the deliberations of the CBCAG as a starting point for efficient Collaboration and Collaboration Board discussion.

The CBCAG notes that changing the conditions of the Spokesperson term would need wide support in the Collaboration, which requires time to understand this issue and its consequences. The timeline we foresee for this is: (i) *ATLAS Week February 2019*: Discussion in the Collaboration and Collaboration Board introduced by CBCAG. (ii) *ATLAS Week June 2019*: Decision taken by the Collaboration Board.

Considerations:

- (i) The current term of the ATLAS Spokesperson is two years. There is the possibility for renewal once by a 2/3 majority during the term of office. The Spokesperson appoints Deputies for terms corresponding to each mandate.
- (ii) The overlap between the incumbent and the new elected-Spokesperson is ~8 months (election occurs June/July, term starts March).
- (iii) It takes about one year to learn the job.
- (iv) If a Spokesperson term is two years and is not renewable and a successor is already elected eight months before the incumbent's term ends, the amount of time the

Three-page draft summary by CBCAG of evaluating the Term of Spokesperson (p2/3)

Spokesperson has at full efficiency as sole Spokesperson is of order one year (i.e. about half of the term of office). This is short.

- (v) If a Spokesperson term is 4 years, it is extremely demanding to serve for such a long time¹, in addition the longer the term the less opportunities there are for other outstanding candidates to be Spokesperson.
- (vi) If a Spokesperson term is 2+2 = 4 years, the same considerations outlined in (v) apply.
- (vii) A single term of three years appears to be optimal, avoiding an election process only 8 months after the start of a mandate, and a potentially very long commitment of four years.
- (viii) A three year term is the current practice for both LHCb and ALICE without possibility of re-election². Both collaborations are very happy with this arrangement. Both see three years as “self-evident” for the reasons already cited. A two year term is the current practice for CMS, it has the drawbacks outlined in consideration (iv). CMS is expected to re-open the discussion of the Spokesperson term soon and an alternative being considered is a three year term.

Observations:

- (i) It is harder for university personnel to get buyout the longer a Spokesperson term is, but the position of Spokesperson of ATLAS is so prestigious that almost all institutions would find a way to support it whether it is 2, 3 or 4 years (examples of this are Karl Jakobs and Dave Charlton).
- (ii) In the current 2+2 model the first election is to an open post. In the second election one of the candidates is the incumbent. In consequence, the second election is a confirmation (or not) of the incumbent. The confirmation provides a checkpoint i.e. an opportunity for the Collaboration to assess a Spokesperson relatively early in their term and determine if they should continue.
- (iii) The history of ATLAS Spokespersons demonstrates that the selection of candidates for ATLAS Spokesperson is meticulous and robust. Only collaborators with a long history of outstandingly capable, reliable and dedicated service, the highest standards of integrity, and who are widely known and trusted, appear on the shortlist from the Spokesperson Search Committee. Therefore it is a priori highly unlikely that at the checkpoint the Collaboration would decide a Spokesperson

should not continue. This has been the case and the confirmation has served only as an affirmation of the Spokesperson. Therefore the election after two years is unnecessary.

Summary

Current Spokesperson term: The term of the ATLAS Spokesperson is two years. There is the possibility for renewal once by a 2/3 majority during the term of office. The Spokesperson appoints Deputies for terms corresponding to each mandate.

Our considerations and observations suggest that the advantages of a three year term outweigh the value of the confirmation in the 2+2 model. Therefore a possible change is:

Proposed Spokesperson term: The term of the ATLAS Spokesperson is three years, not renewable. The Spokesperson appoints Deputies for terms corresponding to the mandate.

An alternative proposed Spokesperson term: The term of the ATLAS Spokesperson is three years, not renewable in consecutive terms. The Spokesperson appoints Deputies for terms corresponding to the mandate.

There are other changes to the Spokesperson term that the Collaboration and the Collaboration Board might wish to propose instead. There is also the possibility the Collaboration and Collaboration Board might wish to retain the current Spokesperson term.

This position paper has been written by the CBCAG as part of the preparation for the consideration of this issue by the Collaboration and Collaboration Board during the February 2019 ATLAS week.

*) Members of the CBCAG atlas-cb-advisory@cern.ch

Calin Alexa (Bucharest IFIN-HH)
Ludovica Aperio Bella (CERN)
Shikma Bressler (Weizmann, Rehovot)
Alexander Cheplakov (JINR, Dubna)
Brian Cole (Columbia)
Claudia Glasman (Madrid UA)
Deepak Kar (Witwatersrand)
Marco Leite (Sao Paulo)
Fabienne Ledroit (Grenoble LPSC)
Jim Pilcher (Chicago)

Ian Shipsey (Oxford)
Jonas Strandberg (Stockholm KTH)
Geoffrey Taylor (Melbourne)
Katsuo Tokushuku (ex-Deputy CB Chair, KEK Tokyo)
Tamara Vazquez Schroeder (McGill)
Haijun Yang (Shanghai)
Max Klein (CB Chair, Liverpool)
Aleandro Nisati (Deputy CB Chair, INFN Rome)
ATLAS Management (ex-officio)

¹ Factors will vary by individual but a 2+2 = 4 year term may present a challenge for university faculty needing to care for their own research groups, and there may be family considerations for example when children are young and home is a long distance from CERN. Factors such as these will limit the pool of university based spokesperson candidates much more so than the pool of CERN spokesperson candidates.

² Although the term of the LHCb Spokesperson is nominally for three years, candidates will not be discounted if they can only commit to two years. For LHCb the appointment of the Spokesperson is for a three-year term, without possibility of re-election for a consecutive term. For ALICE the appointment of the Spokesperson is for a three-year term, without possibility of re-election.

Proposal

Current Spokesperson term: The term of the ATLAS Spokesperson is two years. There is the possibility for renewal once by a 2/3 majority during the term of office. The Spokesperson appoints Deputies for terms corresponding to each mandate.

Our considerations and observations suggest that the advantages of a three year term outweigh the value of the confirmation in the 2+2 model.

Therefore:

Proposed Spokesperson term: The term of the ATLAS Spokesperson is three years, not renewable. The Spokesperson appoints Deputies for terms corresponding to the mandate.

CBCAG + CB Chair + Deputies (ex+current), supported by the Management

Yesterday: Ian Shipsey's summary of observations and considerations + reactions.

Today: invite for further thoughts.

Then: Send the CBCAG 3 page document, possibly modified, to the CB+Collaboration for further consideration and decision by the Collaboration Board in June.